

Final Report on the Selection Process

Call # 4 - Implementation of pilot projects of living labs for decarbonisation and climate change mitigation ¹

- The call for proposals opened at the EEA Grants Site on January the 30th 2020 and closed on October the 20th 2020.
- Seven eligible applications were received summing up a total requested funding of 9.092.042,46€. Being the allocation available 6 058 801,09 €, the projects submitted made up 1.5 times the allocation available
- According to point 13.2 of the Call after the scoring process of the projects, the Secretary General for Environment provided the ranked list of projects to the Selection Committee and to FMO.
- The projects funding rate was screened in order to comply with state Aid rules in force and consider any and all other forms of public support granted to projects. Any remaining costs of the project shall be provided or obtained by the project's promoters.
- The legal status of each entity, either project promoted or partner, was assessed in face of the Article 25.^o of Commission Regulation (EU) n.º 651/2014, of 16 June, declaring certain categories of aid compatible with the internal market, in application of Articles 107 and 108 of the Treaty (GBER).
- Following to the 1st meeting of the Selection Committee on the 29th of January, the Programme Operator (PO), verified that the selection process has been conducted in accordance with the "Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area (EEA) Financial Mechanism 2014-2021" and that the recommendations from the Selection Committee comply with the rules and objectives of the programme, the PO notified the applicants about the provisional results of the selection process, on the 1st of February 2021.

¹ <https://www.eeagrants.gov.pt/en/programmes/environment/calls/call4-implementation-of-pilot-projects-of-living-labs-for-decarbonisation-and-climate-change-mitigation/>

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

- The provisional list of the projects ranked by Overall Score (OS) is presented below:

Final Provisional List of the candidate projects, ranked by Overall Score

Application number	Municipality - Name of the Project*	Overall Score (0-100 points)	Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund	Project grant rate %
03/Call #4	Porto Asprela + Sustentável *	99,22	986 137,19 €	68
01/Call #4	Cascais SmartPole *	97,71	959 163,83 €	82
06/Call #4	Loures PAB_LivingLab +	94,44	900 931,48 €	81
05/Call #4	Sintra SMILE -*	93	875 400,00 €	74
07/Call #4	Lisboa Hub Criativo do Beato	88,44	794 187,50 €	40
02/Call #4	Sintra I4efficiency *	88,19	779 324,69 €	71
04/Call #4	Gaia Living Lab da Afurada *	87,91	763 656,39 €	70
Total			6 058 801,089 €	

* Projects with Partners from Donor Countries

- It started then the period of ten working days for appealing from the project promoters of their classification. This period ended on 16 February 2021.
- Four project promoters have agreed with the Provisional List of the candidate projects, ranked by Overall Score, adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund, presented on the document “Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List”.
- Three promoters have submitted their allegations. The table below summarizes these project’s allegations. On annex the complains and the response to allegations.

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

Application n.º:	Name of the Project	Promotor	Appeal			
			date	Kind of appeal	Content	Annexes
04_Call#4	Gaia Living Lab da Afurada	CEDES – ASSOCIAÇÃO PARA UM CENTRO DE ESTUDOS EM DESENVOLVIMENTO SUSTENTÁVEL 04/Call#4 - LIVING LAB DA AFURADA	15/02/2021	Utterance	<p>Criteria A Technical knowledge of the project team: applicant and partners involved:</p> <p>Criteria C Overall quality of the application submitted Calendar and scheduling of activities</p> <p><u>Detailed Technical Analysis</u> Financial sustainability of the project.</p>	Living_LAB_Afurada_EXPOSIÇÃO.pdf

date	Who	Reply		Overall Score	
		Content	Annexes	Provisional List	After Appealing
03/03/2021	Experts	The Team CVs do not cover all the priority areas. <u>The score is confirmed</u>	04_Call#4_Pronuncia_RespostaOP CEDES- GAIA	87,91	94,16
	Experts	The calendar exceed the time frame, but after clarification the <u>score was upgraded to 5 points</u>			
	Experts	This is a comment field. The sourcing of the project is based on the criteria set out at the call regulation. The financial indicators relating to the promotor are at a risk level. As such the financial indicators relating to 2 partners with 33% of the cost of the project were considered.			
	PO	Considering the financial indicators on the provisional map <u>the score is upgraded 5 points.</u>			

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

Order of classification	Application n.º:	Name of the Project	Promotor	Appeal			
				date	Kind of appeal	Content	
3º	06_Call#4	PAB_LivingLab - Loures -Vive a descarbonização no Parque Adão Barata	AIDGLOBAL, Promotor do ProJet	12/02/2021	Utterance	<p><u>Criteria E - Financial sustainability of the project</u> The promoter is an NGO. As such expects to get the 90% maximum of financial support. And not 81%,.</p> <p><u>Methodology of the fund Allocation:</u> According to Regulation only one project per municipality should be approved</p>	2021_02_16_Carta_Reclamacao_AIDGLOBAL
3º	06_Call#4	PAB_LivingLab - Loures -Vive a descarbonização no Parque Adão Barata	Câmara Municipal de Loures- DESA-Divisão de Energia e Sustentabilidade Ambiental, Parceiro de ProJet	16/02/2021	Utterance	<p><u>Methodology of the fund Allocation:</u> According to Regulation only one project per municipality should be approved.</p>	S-6409-2021
3º	06_Call#4	PAB_LivingLab - Loures -Vive a descarbonização no Parque Adão Barata	IST, Parceiro de Projeto	18/02/2021	Utterance	<p><u>Methodology of the fund Allocation:</u> According to Regulation only one project per municipality should be approved</p>	Posição do IST face aos resultados provisórios aviso de concurso 4.pdf

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

date	Who	Reply		Overall Score	
		Contend	Annexes	Provisional List	After Appealing
04/03/2021	Experts	The Call regulation establishes on point 6, “6. FINANCING RATE: The eligible costs of the selected project shall be financed up until a maximum of 50% grant amount, except where the project promoters are non-governmental organizations, hereinafter referred to as NGOs, or social partners, in accordance with 1.6 (n) and (y) of the 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area (EEA) Financial Mechanism 2014-2021', in which case <u>maximum grant amount is 90%</u> . The project rate shall in all cases be set at a level that complies with state Aid rules in force and takes into account any and all other forms of public support granted to projects. Any remaining costs of the project shall be provided or obtained by the project promoter as established at Article 6.4.4 of 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area Financial Mechanism 2014-2021' (EEA FM 2014-2021 Regulation).” Considering this we confirm the methodology adopted of distributing the allocation available by all the seven candidates, adjusting the reduction needed to meet the allocation limit, according to the merit as explained on the document “Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List” which we quote “Being the difference between the requested funding and the call allocation 904 932,86 €, and the total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%, 51,9% points, each percentage point difference to 100% reduces the amount in 17 712,52€. As such, the column '2 Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' reflects the adjustment by merit.” The percentage of 90% is a maximum value, as set out by the expression "up to". <u>In the light of the above we confirm the methodology adopted, which complies thoroughly with the call regulation.</u>	06_Call#4_AIDGLO BAL Promotor Pronuncia_Respost aOP LOURES	94,44	94,44

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

04/03/2021	PO	<p>The Call regulation establishes on point 1.: "PRIORITY AREAS The purpose of this Call is to support at least one application for each municipality within the applicable territorial scope". It does not determine a maximum n. of projects per municipality, i.e. it does not limit to "only one "project per municipality. As referred the aim is to support at least one project per municipality. At the Call regulation, point 12, SELECTION CRITERIA I tis established that the criteria for financing is the overall score, with the limits established on point 3 and 6: "3. TOTAL AVAILABLE ALLOCATION: The allocation available for this Call is: 6.058.823€ Minimum grant amount of financing for each project: 200.000€. Maximum grant amount of financing for each project: 1.000.000€", "6. FINANCING RATE: The eligible costs of the selected project shall be financed up until a maximum of 50% grant amount, except where the project promoters are non-governmental organizations, hereinafter referred to as NGOs, or social partners, in accordance with 1.6 (n) and (y) of the 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area (EEA) Financial Mechanism 2014-2021', in which case maximum grant amount is 90%. The project rate shall in all cases be set at a level that complies with state Aid rules in force and takes into account any and all other forms of public support granted to projects. Any remaining costs of the project shall be provided or obtained by the project promoter as established at Article 6.4.4 of 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area Financial Mechanism 2014-2021' (EEA FM 2014-2021 Regulation)." Considering this we confirm the methodology adopted of distributing the allocation available by all the seven candidates, adjusting the reduction needed to meet the allocation limit, according to the merit as explained on the document "Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List" which we quote "Being the difference between the requested funding and the call allocation 904 932,86 €, and the total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%, 51,9% points, each percentage point difference to 100% reduces the amount in 17 712,52€. As such, the column '2 Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' reflects the adjustment by merit." <u>In the light of the above we confirm the methodology adopted, which complies thoroughly with the call regulation.</u></p>	06_Call#4_AIDGLO BAL Promotor Pronuncia_Respost aOP LOURES	94,44	94,44
------------	----	--	---	-------	-------

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

04/03/2021	PO	<p>The Call regulation establishes on point 1.: "PRIORITY AREAS The purpose of this Call is to support at least one application for each municipality within the applicable territorial scope". It does not determine a maximum n. of projects per municipality, i.e. it does not limit to "only one "project per municipality. As referred the aim is to support at least one project per municipality. At the Call regulation, point 12, SELECTION CRITERIA I tis established that the criteria for financing is the overall score, with the limits established on point 3 and 6: "3. TOTAL AVAILABLE ALLOCATION: The allocation available for this Call is: 6.058.823€ Minimum grant amount of financing for each project: 200.000€. Maximum grant amount of financing for each project: 1.000.000€", "6. FINANCING RATE: The eligible costs of the selected project shall be financed up until a maximum of 50% grant amount, except where the project promoters are non-governmental organizations, hereinafter referred to as NGOs, or social partners, in accordance with 1.6 (n) and (y) of the 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area (EEA) Financial Mechanism 2014-2021', in which case maximum grant amount is 90%. The project rate shall in all cases be set at a level that complies with state Aid rules in force and takes into account any and all other forms of public support granted to projects. Any remaining costs of the project shall be provided or obtained by the project promoter as established at Article 6.4.4 of 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area Financial Mechanism 2014-2021' (EEA FM 2014-2021 Regulation)." Considering this we confirm the methodology adopted of distributing the allocation available by all the seven candidates, adjusting the reduction needed to meet the allocation limit, according to the merit as explained on the document "Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List" which we quote "Being the difference between the requested funding and the call allocation 904 932,86 €, and the total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%, 51,9% points, each percentage point difference to 100% reduces the amount in 17 712,52€. As such, the column '2 Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' reflects the adjustment by merit." <u>In the light of the above we confirm the methodology adopted, which complies thoroughly with the call regulation.</u></p>	06_Call#4_IST Pronuncia_Respost aOP LOURES	94,44	94,44
------------	----	--	--	-------	-------

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

Order of classification	Application n.º:	Name of the Project	Promotor	Appeal			
				date	Kind of appeal	Content	
6º	07_Call#4	Lisboa Hub Criativo do Beato	AIEL – Associação para a Inovação e Empreendedorismo de Lisboa	11/02/2021	Utterance	<p><u>Criteria A: - Criteria A Technical knowledge of the project team: applicant and partners involved:</u> Balanced representation of women and men should get the maximum score.</p> <p><u>Criteria B-Inclusion of partners from Donor State(s)</u></p> <p><i>The inclusion of partners from donor countries was implied on the activities.</i></p> <p><i>On thee document F "Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List there is a table were this projects is indicated as having partners from donor countries</i></p> <p><u>Criteria D Monitoring plan and information management, system of indicators to be implemented and goals to be achieved, including the estimated number of jobs created</u> The Monitoring plan is under valued.</p> <p><u>Methodology of the fund Allocation:</u> The methodology should take into account the co-financing effort of the project.</p> <p><i>According to Regulation only one project per municipality should be approved</i></p>	Audiência_Prévia_r equerimento_aleg ações_07_Call #4

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

date	Who	Contend	Annexes	Provisional List	After Appealing
04/03/2021	PO	The score was upgraded to 100% on the balance representation of women and men.	Audiência_Prévia_r equerimento_aleg ações_07_Call #4.pdf	88,44	91,25
	Experts	There were no Partners form Donor Countries presented on the application			
	PO	<u>There were no Partners form Donor Countries presented on the application, neither any letter of interest.</u>			
	PO	The information on the table referred was a mistake, already corrected and it did not reflect in any way on the Overall Score, <u>as this criteria is scored as zero, as it should.</u>			
		The application does not include the following indicators listed on the Annex 1 of the call:: "Number of innovative financial mitigation measures" "n. of low carbon measures financed" Number of awareness campaigns" <u>As such the score is not changed.</u>			
	PO	The co-financing rate is not considered on the regulation call as a criteria for the project financing. As such it can not be introduced as criteria, at this stage. The criteria is based on point 12: SELECTION CRITERIA: Applications shall be assessed in accordance with the following criteria, which shall be awarded a score of 0 points (min.) to 100 points (max.). The overall score of each application is obtained with the following formula: Overall Score (OS) = [(A x 0,15) + (B x 0,05) + (C x 0,30) + (D x 0,15) + (E x 0,10) + (F x 0,25)] = 100 whereby: A – Technical know-how of the project team; B – Inclusion of partner entities of the Donor State(s); C – General quality of the submitted application; D – Information monitoring and management plan and system of indicators to be implemented; E – Financial sustainability of the project; F– Specific criteria.			
	PO	The Call regulation establishes on point 1.: "PRIORITY AREAS The purpose of this Call is to support at least one application for each municipality within the applicable territorial scope". It does not determine a maximum n. of projects per municipality, i.e. it does not limit to "only one "project per municipality. As referred the aim is to support at least one project per municipality. At the Call regulation, point 12, SELECTION CRITERIA I tis established that the criteria for financing is the overall score, with the limits established on point 3 and 6: "3. TOTAL AVAILABLE ALLOCATION: The allocation available for this Call is: 6.058.823€ Minimum grant amount of financing for each project: 200.000€. Maximum grant amount of financing for each project: 1.000.000€", "6. FINANCING RATE: The eligible costs of the selected project shall be financed up until a maximum of 50% grant amount, except where the project promoters are non-governmental organizations, hereinafter referred to as NGOs, or social partners, in accordance with 1.6 (n) and (y) of the 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area (EEA) Financial Mechanism 2014-2021', in which case maximum grant amount is 90%. The project rate shall in all cases be set at a level that complies with state Aid rules in force and takes into account any and all other forms of public support granted to projects. Any remaining costs of the project shall be provided or obtained by the project promoter as established at Article 6.4.4 of 'Regulation on the implementation of the European Economic Area Financial Mechanism 2014-2021' (EEA FM 2014-2021 Regulation)." Considering this we confirm the methodology adopted of distributing the allocation available by all the seven candidates, adjusting the reduction needed to meet the allocation limit, according to the merit as explained on the document "Results of the Selection Committee – Provisional List" which we quote "Being the difference between the requested funding and the call allocation 904 932,86 €, and the total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%, 51,9% points, each percentage point difference to 100% reduces the amount in 17 712,52€. As such, the column '2 Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' reflects the adjustment by merit: <u>in the light of the above we confirm the methodology adopted, which complies thoroughly with the call regulation.</u>			

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

- The PO analysed these allegations, submitted them to the experts' appreciation, reviewed in detail each of the applications, and gave formal feed-back to each of the promoters and partners allegations, justifying their classification.
- In two of the projects the classification was upgraded. As consequence the ranking of the projects had been changed as well as the Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund as presented at the table below, 'Final List of the candidate projects, ranked by Overall Score, adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' .

Final List of the candidate projects, ranked by Overall Score, adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund'

Application number	Municipality - Name of the Project*	Overall Score (0-100 points) (in red upgraded)	Total Project Cost	Funding of Environment Programme according to grant rate and maximum by project	Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund	Grant rate (adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund) %	Extra amount co-financed by Consortium
03/Call #4	Porto Asprela + Sustentável *	99,22	1 446 355,73 €	1 000 000,00 €	983 229,37 €	68	16 770,63 €
01/Call #4	Cascais SmartPole *	97,71	1 174 028,04 €	1 000 000,00 €	950 598,17 €	81	49 401,83 €
06/Call #4	Loures PAB_LivingLab +	94,44	1 110 899,78 €	999 809,80 €	880 178,31 €	79	119 631,50 €
04/Call #4	Gaia Living Lab da Afurada *	94,16	1 084 301,00 €	975 870,90 €	850 114,27 €	78	125 756,63 €
05/Call #4	Sintra SMILE -*	93,00	1 178 621,03 €	1 000 000,00 €	849 264,31 €	72	150 735,69 €
07/Call #4	Lisboa Hub Criativo do Beato	91,25	2 000 000,00 €	1 000 000,00 €	811 580,39 €	41	188 419,61 €
02/Call #4	Sintra I4efficiency *	88,19	1 097 836,88 €	988 053,19 €	733 836,26 €	67	254 216,93 €
Total			9 092 042,46 €	6 963 733,89 €	6 058 801,09 €		904 932,80 €

* Projects with Partners from Donor Countries

** Rational of the adjustment by project merit and limit of allocation fund

EEA and Norwegian Financial Mechanisms 2014-2020
Environment, Climate Change and Low Carbon Economy Programme

Difference between the requested funding and the call allocation	Total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%	For each project, each percentage point difference to 100%, reduces the funding amount in: (e.g. in project 03 = $(100-99,22) * €21533,67$ = $€16\,770,63$) Extra amount co-financed by promoter 03
904 932,86 €	42,02%	21 533,67€
Being the difference between the requested funding and the call allocation 904 932,86 €, and the total sum of differences of each overall score to 100%, 42,02% points, each percentage point difference to 100% reduces the amount in 21 533,67€. As such, the column '2 Funding of Environment Programme adjusted by project merit and limit of allocation fund' reflects the adjustment by merit.		

The Secretary General for Environment,

Alexandra Carvalho